Summary of the Literature: Online Mentorship Models for Nursing Leadership

Recommendations: Important elements of a successful mentorship program	Supporting evidence	Supporting tools/strategies
Clear guidelines/expectations related to frequency of meetings, method of communication	• It is important to clarify the difference between online and traditional mentoring modalities at start of program (3) • Varying completion rates- programs tend to lose mentors/mentees if engagement is lost, if roles are not clearly defined and clear goals and meeting guidelines not established (4) • Explicit plans for mentor-mentee communication and regular meetings must be clearly articulated and quantified (4) • Mentors and mentees negotiate their own ways of working, communicating (e.g., face to face, skype etc.; 5) • Solidify the dyad relationship by: creating collegiality; establishing regular communication; exchanging frequent feedback between mentor and mentee; building a supportive environment (6) • Defined expectations of mentoring relationship (how often to meet, how they would communicate and in what manner, and whether or not visits to each other's facility would be beneficial). A commitment to regular and recurring communication was necessary (7) • No formula for how often they should communicate or the length of a mentoring relationship- regular reviews of the relationship will guide this process (9) • Importance of regular meetings- need to establish routine times for meetings- important (10)	• During the course, students and mentors were connected through a dedicated website with a common discussion board (2) • Lach et al (2013) have developed a visual Reciprocal model of distance mentoring (4)

Recognition as in incentive for mentors and mentees to encourage participation/recruitment	• Kroelinger et al (2012), states that recognition is an important element of mentoring programs (1) • Veteran's Health Administration Mentoring Model continues to promote the certification of experienced nurse executives so that there is a continuous pool of resources to draw from. The program has demonstrated its success over the past 3 years by providing a standardized approach to support newly appointed nurse executives in their role and supporting succession planning (7) • Successful mentorship program requirements-recognition for mentors and mentees (10)	• Suggests the use of conferences to recruit and for formal recognition (2) • Certification course for mentors (recognition of their role and increases recruitment; 6)
Training for both mentors and mentees is an important element of a successful mentorship program (training supports need for clear roles and responsibilities, understanding of available tools, resources available to support roles)	• Kroelinger et al (2012) states that career mentoring sessions for students and young professionals is important (1) • preparation for role of mentor and mentee recognized as essential to its effectiveness (5) • Mentors participate in a one day interactive preparation program designed to develop their skills in building an effective mentoring relationship. Build a community of mentoring practice (5) • Mentoring training programs are important to the success of mentorship program (6) • Enhancers-factors within the mentorship initiative that strengthen, augment, intensify, or increase the value of the mentorship implementation within a health unit: previous experience with mentorship; training for mentorship; use of Nursing Mentorship Resource Guide (NMRG); anticipated confidence in the role; length of time in the mentorship initiative; mentor/mentee matching; mentor/mentee support; assistance with	• Nursing Mentorship Resource Guide (NMRG) as a tool to guide training needs

	learning plan; organizational supports; and operational supports (10).	
Organizational support is highlighted as an important element of a successful mentorship program (both the mentor and mentee require the support of their organization)	• Miller et al (2008), state that support for mentors for designated time away from work to participate in workshops (training) and mentoring process is important (2) • Time barrier is the most commonly cited reason for mentee and mentor withdrawal from program (3) • Mentors challenged in finding time to devote to mentorship because of competing demands (planning time and options for adequate communication with the mentor; 4) • Release time is recognized as an important element of organizational support needed to ensure an effective mentorship program (6) • Formal mentoring occurs when the mentoring relationship is facilitated and supported by the organization so that a large pool of participants can benefit (9) • Generic resources, tools and guidelines are used to support the creation and maintenance of mentoring relationship (9) • Boundaries, barriers and concerns that need to be considered when implementing a mentoring framework include: mentoring is time consuming and emotionally draining; mentors may develop attitudes of superiority which may result in exploitation, fostering of dependency, anxiety, manipulation or inappropriate demands; failure to measure outcomes; lack of appropriate commitment and support and/or sponsorship from organization; withdrawal from the relationship; peer resentment of mentee-mentor relationship; lack of appropriate resources (9) • Challenges/Barriers(those factors that have the potential	• Use of tools and guidelines are helpful in supporting and maintaining the mentoring relationship (9). • Nursing Mentorship Resource Guide (NMRG)

	of obstructing, delaying or hindering the implementation of mentorship in a health unit)- Time (scheduling meetings, prep time, time to build relationship with mentee; mentee felt time to complete tasks, time to meet with mentor); difference in attitudes and philosophies between mentor/mentee; skills of mentor- 'mentors may not be as qualified or up to date in an area I want to learn more about'; type and quality of communication- concerns related to effectiveness of communicating with mentors by e-mail rather than face-to-face; balancing workload; risk- information on relationship boundaries as helpful in NMRG (10)	
Open communication is recognized as an important element of the mentor/mentee relationship	• Recognizes the value of online in promoting conversations that might not otherwise occur face-to-face (2) • Students identified delayed responses as a concern. Mentors cited long-distance communication and limited time as problematic (2) • When mentees withdrew, they often did not communicate to mentors, leaving them feeling frustrated- this impacts future recruitment of mentors (3) • Establishment of a trusting coach-coachee relationship/ building the coaching relationship (strategies= being objective, demonstrating empathy and curiosity by the coach; coach's understanding of the organizational requirements, culture and philosophy also assist in sustaining an effective relationship; 8)	• Opinions about mentee blog varied with suggestions made to improve website functionality and usability: 'weekly discussion topic facilitated on the board, able to read other people's responses (3)
Appropriate match of mentor/mentee is recognized as one of the most important elements of a successful mentorship dyad	• Finding the match between mentor and student to enable learning-this was based on common interests and expectations, diversity of nursing experiences, also based on long-distance- no inter-agency relationships (2) • Mentees working in different fields of public health to	• Mentor's letter of support needs to convey their qualifications and how their expertise can help the mentee reach his or her goals (4)

	their mentor reported that the lack of a shared topic of interest discouraged them from proactively engaging with their mentor. Mentees appreciated being matched with an experienced PH professional but found it difficult to develop a strong relationship due to working in different areas of PH (3).	• Includes a leader skills self-assessment to evaluate leadership style and assist with senior leadership team integration (7)
	• Most critical element identified is the match between the mentee's career goals and mentor's experience (4)	• Use of leadership competencies to guide matching- mentee identifies 3 competencies in which he or she desired further
	• Mentors apply and are appointed to the scheme using predetermined criteria (recognized leadership in the field of health and research; professional portfolio that demonstrates significant track record in competitive grant capture, publication and capacity building in health research; experience of interdisciplinary working and an appreciation of the different ways of working in professions; in a position where they are active in leading and developing research; enthusiastic about developing the potential of others; 5)	development and the mentor asked to identify 3 competencies in which he or she exhibited strength. Match is based on pairing of these needs (7)
	• Recruitment and matching- all eligible National Institute of Health Research (NIHR) fellows are contacted and invited to enroll for mentoring in the scheme. Once enrolled, they nominate three candidate mentors from the scheme faculty(encouraged to select mentors who possess skills and knowledge that might otherwise be unavailable to them; 5)	• A 360 assessment and a Myers-Briggs Type Indicator (MBTI) evaluation to assist in identifying managerial styles and strengths and weaknesses of the individual participants facilitated appropriate matching (7)
	• Mentees are matched with one of their nominated mentors- an initial conversation is brokered to ensure compatible (ensure realistic expectations and mutual respect)- after they confirm that they are ok to proceed (5)	
	• An effective mentoring program is based on achieving appropriately matched dyads by; using pairing scenarios; seeking dyad input during the matching process (6)	
	• The High Performance Development Model (HPDM)	

provides a framework to develop a highly skilled, customer-centered workforce for the 21st century. Survey questions were created to reflect core competencies. Mentees were asked to identify 3 competencies in which he or she desired further development and the mentor asked to identify 3 competencies in which he or she exhibited strength. Matching of mentees and mentors was accomplished on the basis of the self-identified strengths and identified areas for development (7)

- Need to consider characteristics and attitudes (specific characteristics of mentor and mentee listed , e.g., able to encourage, see potential in others, role model, accept change, problem solving skills, provide constructive feedback, challenge, analyze and evaluate…9)
- Matching of formal mentors and mentees- success dependent on several key factors such as mentors experience, knowledge, skills, and professional/organizational knowledge. Mentor should purposefully seek relevant opportunities for the mentee, be aware of and apply the principles of succession management/career development in assisting the mentee (9)
- Mentor/mentee matching should be based on mutual respect, trust and an understanding of the others responsibilities in the relationship. Relationships are more successful when the styles of the dyad are compatible in outlook, goals and style (assigning can be difficult because mentoring is informal by nature; 10)
- Enhancers-factors within the mentorship initiative that strengthen, augment, intensify, or increase the value of the mentorship implementation within a health unit: previous experience with mentorship; training for mentorship; use of NMRG; anticipated confidence in the

	role; length of time in the mentorship initiative; mentor/mentee matching; mentor/mentee support; assistance with learning plan; organizational supports; and operational supports (10)	
Clear roles and responsibilities- success of the mentorship dyad depends on both the mentor and mentee having a clear understanding of the roles and responsibilities of each (this can be achieved through training, early discussions up front identifying goals/objectives and commitment of each)	• Determining what the responsibilities are of both the mentor and the learner to the learning situation, who is accountable to what, what the measures of success will be, and how to bring the mentoring relationship to closure- achieved through personal interaction prior to the start of the online course (2) • As the mentor and mentee move through the mentoring process, the mentor's input fades over an unspecified time frame and is overtaken by the mentee's self-directed learning. At this point, the mentor's responsibility shifts from the early role of facilitator to providing help only when asked (2) • Varying completion rates- programs tend to lose mentors/mentees if engagement is lost, if roles are not clearly defined and clear goals and meeting guidelines not established (4) • Advocate for and guide the mentee by: providing psychosocial support; achieving life balance; advising career progression. Integrate the mentee into the academic culture by: teaching networking skills; facilitating socialization (6) • Role of the mentor- challenging thinking and promoting new behaviours, supporting the coachee to take action, facilitating achievement of results (8) • Roles and responsibilities- to facilitate success both mentor and mentee must understand their roles and responsibilities. Mentor roles- meet regularly with mentee, listen to mentees needs, facilitate mentees development, motivate and support in achievement of goals, provide information, guidance and constructive	• NMRG- useful guide to facilitate in-house training sessions for mentors and mentees, clarify roles, responsibilities and tasks of mentors, mentees, the champions etc. (10)

	feedback; facilitating and evaluating mentees decision making and problem solving; reviewing and evaluating relationship; maintaining a professional relationship; acting as a role model; providing evidence of mentees achievements; maintaining confidentiality of matters discussed. Mentees role: identifying and achieving new knowledge and skills applicable to their career; seeking guidance and advice related to ongoing developmental opportunities; actively accepting responsibility for own development, decision and actions; acting on 'expert' advice, relating this to evidence based practice findings; completing tasks and projects to a satisfactory standard; being receptive to feedback; maintaining confidentiality of matters discussed; allocating time to complete developmental tasks and prepare for the meetings with mentor; keeping mentors advised of availability and making time to meet (9)	
Clear goals and objectives need to be identified from the start. The goals and objectives will help in determining the roles of each and in determining when the mentorship is complete.	• When clear goals and objectives are identified, the endpoint is much clearer. Mentor and mentee need to be able to assess progress and determine when mentorship is complete. The relationship is brought to a close, with a clear endpoint identified and exit strategy implemented (2) • Mentees identify goals and aspirations. This is helpful to determining an appropriate match (5) • Establish clear mentorship purpose & goals by: expressing reciprocity, specifying time commitment; planning activities spread over time (6) • Goals mutually agreed upon, electronic personal development plan was initiated by the mentee in collaboration with mentor. Template provided an active document for planning and tracking learning successes and was readily available to our mentoring program (7)	• Suggest completing an assessment of the learning situation, reflecting on both the process and achievement of predetermined learning outcomes (2) • Template used to track learning successes (7) • Use of tools to support reflection on areas of strengths, goals and aspirations, shortfalls, expectations and approaches to challenges and conflict (8) • Use of guided questions and leadership development frameworks to shape the

	• Thorough assessment for problem identification and goal setting to address development issues (tools that support reflection on the coaches areas of strengths, goals and aspirations, shortfalls, expectations, and approaches to challenge and conflict help in setting appropriate developmental goals); problem solving by development of action plans (8) • Allowing coachees/mentees to define the goals and discussion topics for coaching conversations (8) • Initial meeting between mentor and mentee is important to agree on some basic principles and the purpose of the relationship. Clear statement of expectations for both parties and the goals to be achieved will assist with the relationship to produce desired outcomes (9) • Evaluation of mentoring relationship is recommended to assist mentors and mentees to make decisions about- how well relationship is going; what has been achieved; what changes need to be made; when is the time to end the mentoring relationship; future education and training requirements (9)	coaching conversations and explore leadership topics (8) • Use of framework to clearly identify the capabilities needed to successfully lead (e.g., LEADS Framework- LEADS identifies the higher level skills which go beyond bare minimum competencies; 8) • In preparation and planning for mentoring, the needs, interests and concerns and expectations of the mentee need to be explored (NICE- tool can be used to guide and assist in these discussions; suggest providing NICE to mentee prior to meetings; 9) • Use of Mentoring Agreement Review form can be useful for this- Original Goals/What has been achieved/What more needs to be done/any new goals/actions to be taken/by whom/when/next review date; 9)
Administrative support- much of the literature speaks to the need/value of having adequate administrative support for the mentorship program. Administrative support frequently referred to the need to have a coordinator, someone responsible for	• Loose unstructured relationships and insufficient administrative support for the mentoring commitment can lead to mentoring problems (miscommunication and disengagement; 2) • Participants wanted program organizer to provide more support and guidance throughout the program (3) • Mobilize institutional resources by: gaining	• Scheme/program organization- the NIHR mentorship scheme is managed by a coordinator with support from an administrator (5)

overseeing the program, someone to whom mentors could go to with questions.	• administrative support; including mentoring expectations in promotion and workload documents; offering mentor training programs; providing release time (6) • Framework for coordinators role: receiving applications from prospective mentors and mentees; facilitating the mentoring partnership; providing training and support to mentors; facilitating the evaluation process; developing and disseminating reports (9) • Success depends on adequate planning, resources, organizational and administrative support as well as appropriate facilitation. Support from organization is critical to success of mentorship. Need a project leader/coordinator to provide the energy required to coordinate the project on a day-to-day basis to achieve goals (10) • Successful mentorship program requirements- organizational challenges- senior admin commitment and active promotion of mentorship was limited, -operational challenges-limited # of mentors and mentees a challenge (can impede ability to appropriately match mentor and mentee when options are limited); sustainability-ongoing need for a dedicated champion to continue mentorship program was identified (10)	
Commitment of mentor and mentee to the mentorship process/program	• Because mentoring is actually about process rather than product, certain key elements need to be in place at the outset of a mentoring program- including commitment by both mentor and mentee to the work of the relationship that is grounded in mutual respect, trust and comfort (2) • Gaining knowledge and skills depended on mentee commitment. Mentees who reported regular engagement from their mentor benefited from the relationship (3)	

	• Mentor's commitment to mentees training and availability to complete the mentoring should be assessed (4) • Must be agreement by both mentor and mentee to invest time, skill and knowledge and emotion into the relationship (9)	
Face-to-face element- research recognized the value of a face-to-face meeting, typically at the onset of the relationship	• Mentees discussed potential benefits of a face-to-face component with mentor: 'would have been nice to meet a mentor….face-to-face would have strengthened relationship' (3) • Once pairings established, face-to-face learning session was implemented for mentors and mentees (7) • Mentoring should be enhanced by initial face-to-face meeting, careful matching of pairs and training for mentors and mentees. Other opportunities should be in place to augment the relationship such as face-to-face interaction (10)	

References

1. Kroelinger CD, Kasehagen L, Barradas DT, & Ali Z. Building Leadership skills and promoting workforce development: Evaluation Data Collected from Public Health Professionals in the Field of M &CH. Maternal Child Health J. 2012 December; 16 (0 2): 370-375

2. Miller LC, Devaney SW, Kelly GL, Kuehn AF. E-Mentoring in Public Health Nursing Practice. The Journal of Continuing Education in Nursing. September 2008. Vol 39, No 9.

3. O'Connell EO, Stoneham M, Saunders J. Planning for the next generation of public health advocates: evaluation of an online advocacy mentoring program. Health Promotion Journal Of Australia, 27, 43-47. 2016.

4. Lach HW, Hertz JE, Pomeroy SH, Resnick B, Buckwalter KC. The challenges and benefits of distance mentoring. J of Professional Nursing, Vol 29 (1). 2013

5. . Byrne G, Topping A, Golding KS. Developing a national mentorship scheme to enhance the contribution of clinical academics to health care. Nurse Researcher, 2014,vol 22 (2).

6. Nick JM, Delahoyde TM, Del Prato D, Mitchell C, Ortiz J, Ottley C, Young P, Cannon SB, Lasater K, Reising D, Siktberg L. Best Practices in Academic Mentoring: A Model for Excellence. Nursing Research and Practice, 2012.

7. Weiss LW, Williams CA, Drake AC, Cumberlander LB, Gordon CL. Veterans Health Administration Mentoring Model for New Nurse Executives. Nurse Admin Q, 2008, vol 32 (3).

8. Bhimani H, Wong C, Roitenerg J, Irvine L.   Debut of a Framework for Coaching and Mentoring Nurses for Leadership.(unknown)

9. Queensland Government. (2011). A Mentoring Framework for Queensland Continence Clinicians and those with a special interest in continence. 2011

10. PHRED. Ontario Nursing Strategy: Preceptorship/Mentorship Initiative. Evaluating a Public Health Nursing Mentorship Initiative. 2007.